

## **Author Kristin Snopkowski's response to Discussant Comments:**

We would like to thank the Discussant for the detailed comments on our paper.

Unfortunately, our dataset does not include information on transfers within households, which is a limitation of our study. Approximately 16% of women reported living with their parents and 9% reported living with in-laws. This means that 25% of couples with children are co-resident with one set of grandparents. Thank you for pointing out the confusion with the sentence at the top of page 6. We were trying to say that since we did not have information on transfers within households, we controlled for whether a couple lived with either set of grandparents when looking at whether help was received by the other set. For example, if the couple is living with maternal grandparents, this was controlled for when help received by paternal grandparents was analyzed. We found that whether the couple lived with one set of grandparents did not have a significant effect on receiving help from the other grandparents. In addition, we also analyzed help received by one set of grandparents based on the help received from the other set and found that if one set of grandparents help, it increased the likelihood of receiving help from the other set, but we did not see an increased likelihood when the other set of grandparents were co-resident (even though we might expect those grandparents may be providing help).

Thank you for bringing the Kreager & Schroder-Butterfill paper to our attention. While no paper can do it all, it's great to have a combination of descriptive, ethnographic pieces that sample fewer people in a couple of communities as well as cross-national papers that can test hypotheses at a country-level. We did control for region, religion and urban or rural context in all analyses. Additionally, we calculated the amount of helping across regions for comparison. In the figure below, we have the amount of help reported by type of grandparent across each region of Indonesia. While the amount of help is somewhat variable, the amount of relative helping by each grandparent type is quite consistent. We welcome any suggestions on how to more appropriately deal with this criticism.

We have not explored the role that young-adult migration may play in grandparental help. Based on the IFLS data, approximately 15% of parents are co-resident, 30% live in the same village, and 15% are no longer living, leaving at most 40% who live in different villages than their parents. Young-adult migration may be much more common among the Minang than other ethnic groups in Indonesia. Finally, I am not entirely clear about your question: Is grandparental support of migration captured in this dataset (presumably not since these cases would largely be co-residential?) If a young-adult migrated to another community, they definitely would not be co-residential, so I'm not entirely sure what you mean by this comment.

Again, thank you very much for your feedback on our manuscript. Your feedback will help us improve future drafts.

