

Discussant: Aravinda Guntapalli

The paper focuses on financial and emotional care provided to institutionalised older people in Punjab, India. The study is relevant given the lack of data on institutionalised older people in India. Punjab, a North Indian state, is one of the states with low sex ratio reflecting bias against women. The findings of the study show that married daughters provide more assistance to older people living in care homes than married sons. However, with the declining sex ratio, the number of families with daughters will decline that will subsequently decline the support received by older people. The policy relevance of the findings has to be discussed in the discussion section of the paper. The analysis has to be improved further so that the discussion relies on robust outcomes.

I agree with the author that most of the studies on institutionalised older people are conducted in European, Australian and Northern American countries. However, some of these papers focused on ethnic minority older people including Indian elders. The literature could focus on such papers for a comparative purpose.

The methodology of the chapter could provide more details. Currently, the methodology chapter is too short and does not provide details on the questionnaire. More information on the quantitative methods employed is required.

Also, the paper could discuss a few limitations of the study.

The study could check if there are any “between care home variations” that could impact the findings of the study.

The study should include a table depicting descriptive statistics. Also, the descriptive statistics could answer the following questions:

- What is the marital status of the respondents?
- How many children do they have?
- Why are they residing in the care homes?
- What is the age composition?
- What is the health status?
- What is their financial status?

The gender component of the paper could be highlighted further. As suggested by the Help Age study, 10% of older people living in care homes opted for these homes as they had only daughters. It would be interesting to do such analysis in this paper.

Statistical tests could be conducted to show if the associations discussed are statistically significant. The current discussion on some of the aspects is based on minor absolute differences in some of the characteristics mentioned provided in the tables. Also, more analysis could be performed by the number of children living in the city and the reasons for living in care homes.

Finally, the study concludes that married daughters provide more assistance in the form of financial and emotional care than sons. The study could also bring in the role played by daughters-in-law as they seem provide more care support on practical aspects than sons.

Hope the comments are helpful in strengthening the paper further!